

**From:** [Grant, Colin](#)  
**To:** [West, Sabrina](#)  
**Subject:** Re: PVA paragraph  
**Date:** Thursday, February 21, 2013 2:54:11 PM

---

Hi Sabrina,

Thanks. I think I will have some time to mess with it tomorrow. I am all done incorporating comments now and just have to do a final run-through. I will let you know if I have any questions on it.

Colin Grant  
Endangered Species Listing Biologist  
Bay-Delta Fish and Wildlife Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 8-300  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
916-930-5651  
[colin\\_grant@fws.gov](mailto:colin_grant@fws.gov)

On Thu, Feb 21, 2013 at 2:49 PM, West, Sabrina <[sabrina\\_west@fws.gov](mailto:sabrina_west@fws.gov)> wrote:

All right, here's my first try. It's not exactly pretty - too many words in the table for that, and I had to shrink the margins down to .5. Do you know how to make a page break so this won't turn the rest of the document horizontal? I can do that for you if you want; it's easiest of the occurrence table is going at the very end of the document.

It also might be easiest if you can shrink down some of the words, like put a star or x if nesting is confirmed at a certain area. Then just explain it in a footnote.

Let me know if you need any other help; I actually don't have much to do today, so I don't mind. I can make the table prettier if you want.

Sabrina West  
Listing and Recovery Division  
Carlsbad Fish and Wildlife Office  
6010 Hidden Valley Road, Suite 101  
Carlsbad, CA 92011

(760)431-9440 ext. 375  
email: [sabrina\\_west@fws.gov](mailto:sabrina_west@fws.gov)

On Thu, Feb 21, 2013 at 12:41 PM, Grant, Colin <[colin\\_grant@fws.gov](mailto:colin_grant@fws.gov)> wrote:

Hi Sabrina,

Wow! This is great. Thanks, I inserted it as is. Not to be giving you more work, but do you think you might have time to convert the occurrence table to something I can insert into the species report.

I have attached it.

thanks

Colin Grant  
Endangered Species Listing Biologist  
Bay-Delta Fish and Wildlife Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 8-300  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
916-930-5651  
[colin\\_grant@fws.gov](mailto:colin_grant@fws.gov)

On Thu, Feb 21, 2013 at 11:03 AM, West, Sabrina <[sabrina\\_west@fws.gov](mailto:sabrina_west@fws.gov)> wrote:  
Hi Colin,

Here, at last, is the PVA paragraph about the Nur *et al* paper that I've been promising you.

"The goal of the Nur *et al.* study is to evaluate the management benefits of house mouse eradication from the SE Farallon Islands. Some of their results of their model display time to extinction. However, it is important to remember that they are not calculating absolute survival probability, but relative survival probability between several management options (Nur *et al.* 2012, p. 13), as is recommended as the more reliable calculation for PVA models (Akçakaya and Raphael 1998, p. 891; Beissinger *et al.* 1998, p. 832). We interpret the predicted population trends with much more caution. The efficacy of PVAs for predicting long-term population trends and probability of extinction is widely debated in the literature (Fieberg and Ellner 2000, p. 2046; Coulson *et al.* 2001, p. 221; but see Brook *et al.* 2000, p. 836). PVAs are considered much more reliable for considering the efficacy of management options, as relative results such as management choices are less sensitive to data gaps or assumptions inherent to any statistical model (Akçakaya and Raphael 1998, p. 891; Beissinger *et al.* 1998, p. 833, Coulson *et al.* 2001, p. 221). We also note that these absolute probabilities of survival apply only to the SE Farallon Islands, and not to the entire range of the species."

This could either be supplemental to or in place of the other paragraph you had. I did purposely try to move away from talking about flaws in the model, because I was trying to stick to what we discussed on the call: trying to avoid poking too many holes in their model. I do realize that this is all somewhat technical with the discussion of absolute vs. relative survival probabilities (and might not pass the sixth grade test). But I guess I think that when discussing model results, there's no getting around that.

Please let me know if you have any questions. I'm teleworking today, so let me know if you want to talk by phone. If the paragraph looks good, I'll send you the references in a separate email.

Cheers,

Sabrina West  
Listing and Recovery Division  
Carlsbad Fish and Wildlife Office  
6010 Hidden Valley Road, Suite 101  
Carlsbad, CA 92011

(760)431-9440 ext. 375

email: [sabrina\\_west@fws.gov](mailto:sabrina_west@fws.gov)